

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA  
ALEXANDRIA DIVISION**

**AMAZON.COM, INC and AMAZON  
DATA SERVICES, INC.,**

Plaintiffs,

v.

**WDC HOLDINGS LLC d/b/a  
NORTHSTAR COMMERCIAL  
PARTNERS, et al.,**

Defendants,

---

**800 HOYT LLC,**

Intervening Interpleader Plaintiff,

v.

**BRIAN WATSON, WDC HOLDING  
LLC, PLW CAPITAL I,  
LLC.AMAZON.COM, INC, and  
AMAZON DATA SERVICES, INC.**

Interpleader Defendants.

**Case No. 1:20cv484**

**Hon. Rossie D. Alston, Jr.  
Hon. Theresa Buchanan**

**DEFENDANTS CARLETON NELSON’S  
AND CHESHIRE VENTURES LLC’S  
MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE  
SURREPLY TO ADDRESS AMAZON’S  
ARGUMENTS CONCERNING RULE 16,  
RULE 20 AND ITS NEW BREACH OF  
CONTRACT CLAIM**

**EXPEDITED CONSIDERATION  
REQUESTED WITHOUT ORAL  
ARGUMENT**

COME NOW Defendants Carleton Nelson and Cheshire Ventures, LLC (the “Nelson Defendants”) through undersigned counsel, and file this motion for leave to file a six (6) page surreply to Amazon’s reply in support of its motion to file a third amended complaint (1) because the reply includes a fulsome discussion of Rule 16, citing many more cases than Amazon originally felt necessary to support its motion under Rule 16; (2) to address Amazon’s baseless claim that it has shown it satisfied the requirements of Rule 20 for joinder of new parties where it does not actually make any argument that the addition of new parties will not delay resolution of the case

and where Amazon failed to even mention Rule 20 in its opening brief; and (3) to address Amazon's unsupported assertion that it previously asserted a breach of contract claim against Nelson based on its own delivery of a hard drive Amazon asserts it did not even know had occurred when it filed the earlier complaints in this action. Nelson could not anticipate an argument that Amazon had already brought a breach of contract claim against him arising from facts related to the hard drive Amazon acknowledges it was unaware of at the time it filed its last complaint. This assertion by Amazon that it had already brought a breach of contract claim related to the retention of the hard drive is all the more confusing and unforeseeable when Amazon's counsel in several communications threatened to bring a claim against Nelson for having possession of the hard drive after Amazon delivered it to him, *see* Doc. 722-1 at 9 (raising several alleged violations Amazon claims Nelson committed by possessing the hard drive) and 13 (requiring Nelson to answer a series of question regarding the hard drive "to resolve [the hard drive issue] without litigation.").

Local Rule 7(F) requires leave of the Court to file such a surreply. "Surreplies may be appropriate when the party seeking to file a surreply 'would be unable to contest matters presented to the court for the first time in the opposing party's reply.'" *Carrasco v. M&T Bank*, No. CV SAG-21-532, 2021 WL 4846844, at \*8 (D. Md. Oct. 18, 2021) (*Khoury v. Meserve*, 268 F. Supp. 2d 600, 605 (D. Md. 2003)). Here Amazon made extremely limited arguments under Rule 16 and no arguments under Rule 20 in its initial brief, despite bearing the burden of proof, meaning Defendants had to anticipate what Amazon might argue on those topics. Further, Nelson could not predict Amazon would attempt to sidestep the issue of futility as to the new breach of contract claim against Nelson by asserting it is not in fact a new breach of contract claim, even when Amazon asserts it was unaware of the hard drive when it filed its last complaint.

Attached hereto as Exhibit A is the proposed surreply the Nelson Defendants request the Court permit them to file. Under Local Rule 7(J) the Nelson Defendants request the Court decide this motion without oral argument.

May 4, 2022

**BURR & FORMAN LLP**

/s/ Rachel Friedman

Rachel Friedman (VA Bar #93898)  
420 North 20th Street, Suite 3400  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Telephone: (205) 251-3000  
Facsimile: (205) 458-5100  
rfriedma@burr.com

/s/ J. Alex Little

J. Alex Little, IV (TN Bar No. 29858) (*pro hac vice*)  
Emily H. Mack (TN Bar No. 31217) (*pro hac vice*)  
222 2nd Ave. S., Suite 2000  
Nashville, TN 37201  
Telephone: (615) 724-3200  
alex.little@burr.com  
emack@burr.com

Adam R. Smart (FL Bar No 1032572) (*pro hac vice*)  
50 North Laura Street, Suite 3000  
Jacksonville, Florida 32202  
Telephone: (904) 232-7200  
asmart@burr.com

*Attorneys for Carleton Nelson and Cheshire Ventures, LLC*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on May 4, 2022, a true and correct copy of the foregoing has been served upon the following via email:

Elizabeth P. Papez (pro hac vice)  
Patrick F. Stokes (pro hac vice)  
Claudia M. Barrett (pro hac vice)  
Michael R. Dziuban  
(Va. State Bar No. 89136)  
GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP  
1050 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20036-5306  
Telephone: (202) 955-8500  
Facsimile: (202) 467-0539  
epapez@gibsondunn.com  
pstokes@gibsondunn.com  
cbarrett@gibsondunn.com  
mdziuban@gibsondunn.com  
Counsel for Plaintiffs  
Amazon.com, Inc. and Amazon Data Services,  
Inc.

Veronica S. Moyé  
(pro hac vice application pending)  
GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP  
2001 Ross Avenue, Suite 2100  
Dallas, TX 75201  
Telephone: (214) 698-3100  
Facsimile: (214) 571-2900  
vmoye@gibsondunn.com  
Counsel for Plaintiffs Amazon.com, Inc. and  
Amazon Data Services, Inc.

Aaron G. McCollough  
McGuireWoods  
77 West Wacker Dr., Suite 4100  
Chicago, IL 60601  
amccollough@mcguirewoods.com  
Counsel for the Receiver Mark Roberts

Casey Kirschner  
635 N. Alvarado Lane  
Plymouth, MN 55447  
casey.kirschner@gmail.com  
*Pro se*

Kathryn M. Skilton  
Michael R. MacPhail  
Faegre Drinker Biddle & Reath LLP  
801 Grand Avenue, 33rd Floor  
Des Moines, Iowa 50309  
kathryn.skilton@faegredrinker.com  
michael.macphail@faegredrinker.com  
Counsel for Intervenor 800 Hoyt, LLC

Stanley L. Garnett  
Justin L. Cohen  
Amanda K. Houseal  
Brownstein Hyatt Farber Schreck LLP  
410 Seventeenth St., Suite 2200  
Denver, CO 80202-4432  
sgarnett@bhfs.com  
jcohen@bhfs.com  
ahouseal@bhfs.com  
Counsel for Defendants Brian Watson, WDC  
Holdings, LLC, NSIPI Administrative Manager,  
Sterling NCP FF, LLC, Manassas NCP FF, LLC

George R. Calhoun  
Jeffrey Hamlin  
James M. Trusty  
Ifrah Law, PLLC  
1717 Pennsylvania Ave, N.W. Suite 650  
Washington, DC 20006 george@ifrahlaw.com  
jhamlin@ifrahlaw.com  
jtrusty@ifrahlaw.com  
Counsel for Defendants Brian Watson, WDC  
Holdings, LLC, NSIPI Administrative Manager,  
Sterling NCP FF, LLC, Manassas NCP FF, LLC

Dated: May 4, 2022

/s/ Rachel Friedman

Rachel Friedman